

A summary table of randomised controlled trials comparing low-carb diets of less than 130g carbohydrate per day to low-fat diets of less than 35% fat of total calories compiled by the Public Health Collaboration

Time Frame & Reference	Low Carb (LC) Weight Loss	Low Fat (LF) Weight Loss	Subjects (LC v LF)	Time Frame & Reference	Low Carb (LC) Weight Loss	Low Fat (LF) Weight Loss	Subjects (LC v LF)
6 Months [1]	8.5kg*	3.9kg	22 v 20	1 Year [34]	5.1kg	3.1kg	62 v 64
12 Months [2]	4.3kg	2.5kg	20 v 17	48 Weeks [35]	11.37kg	9.62kg	57 v 65
6 Months [3]	5.8kg*	1.9kg	43 v 36	3 Months [36]	5.0kg	3.7kg	63 v 66
12 Weeks [4]	9.9kg*	4.1kg	16 v 14	24 Weeks [37]	12.0kg	11.5kg	46 v 47
12 Weeks [5]	6.2kg*	3.4kg	22 v 23	6 Months [38]	6.0kg	5.9kg	57 v 174
24 Weeks [6]	12.7kg*	7.2kg	46 v 34	1 Year [39]	2.1kg	3.0kg	40 v 40
30-50 Days [7]	5.5kg*	3.5kg	28 v 28	6 Weeks [40]	6.1kg*	3.9kg	15 v 15
10 Weeks [8]	7.0kg	6.8kg	15 v 16	24 Weeks [41]	7.1kg*	4.7kg	28 v 30
6 Weeks [9]	6.2kg	6.0kg	16 v 16	3 Months [42]	7.6kg*	4.3kg	22 v 19
6 Weeks [10]	6.4kg*	4.2kg	12 v 11	6 Months [43]	4.3kg	4.0kg	29 v 30
3 Months [11]	3.55kg*	0.92kg	40 v 39	6 Months [44]	2.6kg	1.4kg	12 v 12
12 Weeks [12]	6.3kg	5.3kg	49 v 47	8 Weeks [45]	7.4kg	6.5kg	12 v 12
12 Months [13]	4.7kg*	2.2kg	68 v 61	6 Months [46]	6.8kg	5.6kg	53 v 57
8 Weeks [14]	7.8kg*	6.4kg	48 v 45	3 Months [47]	3.4kg	4.1kg	150 v 150
3 Months [15]	6.9kg*	2.1kg	10 v 10	12 Months [48]	11.8kg*	6.9kg	55 v 55
24 Weeks [16]	11.1kg*	6.9kg	21 v 29	1 Year [49]	2.9kg	3.7kg	30 v 30
2 Years [17]	5.5kg*	3.3kg	83 v 94	6 Months [50]	8.5kg*	3.5kg	43 v 35
8 Weeks [18]	7.5kg*	6.2kg	52 v 47	52 Weeks [51]	9.8kg	10.1kg	41 v 37
24 Weeks [19]	11.9kg	10.1kg	45 v 43	6 Months [52]	9.1kg	8.9kg	25 v 24
12 Weeks [20]	10.1kg*	5.2kg	20 v 20	6 Months [53]	8.0kg	5.7kg	21 v 17
12 Months [21]	14.5kg	11.5kg	33 v 36	6 Months [54]	1.6kg*	0.6kg	30 v 32
13 Weeks [22]	13.2kg*	7.3kg	18 v 15	4 Months [55]	14.7kg*	5.05kg	45 v 40
24 Months [23]	3.6kg	3.1kg	31 v 30	12 Weeks [56]	11.9kg	12.2kg	20 v 18
3 Months [24]	5.5kg*	2.6kg	15 v 18	32 Weeks [57]	12.7kg*	3.0kg	12 v 13
12 Months [25]	5.6kg*	1.4kg	59 v 60	18 Months [58]	5.0kg	2.4 kg	32 v 33
4 Months [26]	9.79kg*	6.14kg	20 v 20	10 Weeks [59]	25.8kg*	2.08kg	10 v 10
8 Weeks [27]	8.4kg*	6.7kg	32 v 28	12 Months [60]	7.9kg*	1.7kg	16 v 18
12 Months [28]	3.1kg	3.1kg	47 v 49	2 Years [61]	6.8kg	6.6kg	33 v 28
2 Years [29]	6.34kg	7.37kg	154 v 153	12 Months [62]	6.0kg	5.3kg	304 v 305
24 Months [30]	1.5kg	0.2kg	28 v 40	12 Weeks [63]	9.5kg*	2.0kg	21 v 12
12 Weeks [31]	6.8kg	5.2kg	18 v 15	12 Weeks [64]	13.72kg*	0.77kg	46 v 45
12 Weeks [32]	8.0kg*	6.4kg	24 v 21	18 Months [65]	2.76kg*	0.71kg	43 v 42
1 Year [33]	13.7kg	13.7kg	55 v 51	8 Weeks [66]	5.9kg*	0.9kg	19 v 15
				12 Months [67]	9.3kg*	5.8kg	76 v 64
				Totals:	36/67 Are Sig. >	0/67 Are Sig. >	2778(LC)
					58/67 Are > LF	7/67 Are > LC	V
					(2 RCTs Are Equal)		2840(LF)

References:

[1] A Randomized Trial Comparing a Very Low Carbohydrate Diet and a Calorie-Restricted Low Fat Diet on Body Weight and Cardiovascular Risk Factors in Healthy Women. Brehm et al. <https://doi.org/10.1210/jc.2002-021480>

[2] A Randomized Trial of a Low-Carbohydrate Diet for Obesity. Foster et al. <https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa022207>

[3] A Low-Carbohydrate as Compared with a Low-Fat Diet in Severe Obesity. Samaha et al. <https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa022637>

[4] Effects of a low-carbohydrate diet on weight loss and cardiovascular risk factor in overweight adolescents. Sondike et al. <https://doi.org/10.1067/mpd.2003.4>

[5] The National Cholesterol Education Program Diet vs a Diet Lower in Carbohydrates and Higher in Protein and Monounsaturated Fat A Randomized Trial. Aude et al. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archinte.164.19.2141>

[6] A Low-Carbohydrate, Ketogenic Diet versus a Low-Fat Diet To Treat Obesity and Hyperlipidemia: A Randomized, Controlled Trial. Yancy et al. <https://doi.org/10.7326/0003-4819-140-10-200405180-00006>

[7] Comparison of energy-restricted very low-carbohydrate and low-fat diets on weight loss and body composition in overweight men and women. Volek et al. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1743-7075-1-13>

[8] Comparison of a Low-Fat Diet to a Low-Carbohydrate Diet on Weight Loss, Body Composition, and Risk Factors for Diabetes and Cardiovascular Disease in Free-Living, Overweight Men and Women. Meckling et al. <https://doi.org/10.1210/jc.2003-031606>

[9] Lack of suppression of circulating free fatty acids and hypercholesterolemia during weight loss on a high-fat, low-carbohydrate diet. Hernandez et al. <https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.2009.27909>

[10] Perceived Hunger Is Lower and Weight Loss Is Greater in Overweight Premenopausal Women Consuming a Low-Carbohydrate/High-Protein vs High-Carbohydrate/Low-Fat Diet. Nickols-Richardson et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jada.2005.06.025>

[11] Short-term effects of severe dietary carbohydrate-restriction advice in Type 2 diabetes—a randomized controlled trial. Daly et al. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1464-5491.2005.01760.x>

[12] Separate effects of reduced carbohydrate intake and weight loss on atherogenic dyslipidemia. Krauss et al. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ajcn/83.5.1025>

[13] Comparison of the Atkins, Zone, Ornish, and LEARN Diets for Change in Weight and Related Risk Factors Among Overweight Premenopausal Women The A TO Z Weight Loss Study: A Randomized Trial. Gardner et al. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.297.9.969>

[14] Low- and high-carbohydrate weight-loss diets have similar effects on mood but not cognitive performance. Halyburton et al. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ajcn/86.3.580>

[15] A low-carbohydrate diet is more effective in reducing body weight than healthy eating in both diabetic and non-diabetic subjects. Dyson et al. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1464-5491.2007.02290.x>

[16] The effect of a low-carbohydrate, ketogenic diet versus a low-glycemic index diet on glycemic control in type 2 diabetes mellitus. Westman et al. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1743-7075-5-36>

[17] Weight Loss with a Low-Carbohydrate, Mediterranean, or Low-Fat Diet. Shai et al.

<https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa0708681>

[18] Effects of weight loss from a very-low-carbohydrate diet on endothelial function and markers of cardiovascular disease risk in subjects with abdominal obesity. Keogh et al. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ajcn/87.3.567>

[19] Metabolic Effects of Weight Loss on a Very-Low-Carbohydrate Diet Compared With an Isocaloric High-Carbohydrate Diet in Abdominally Obese Subjects. Tay et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacc.2007.08.050>

[20] Carbohydrate Restriction has a More Favorable Impact on the Metabolic Syndrome than a Low Fat Diet. Volek et al. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11745-008-3274-2>

[21] Long-term effects of a very-low-carbohydrate weight loss diet compared with an isocaloric low-fat diet after 12 mo. Brinkworth et al. <https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.2008.27326>

[22] Efficacy and Safety of a High Protein, Low Carbohydrate Diet for Weight Loss in Severely Obese Adolescents. Krebs et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpeds.2010.02.010>

[23] In type 2 diabetes, randomisation to advice to follow a low-carbohydrate diet transiently improves glycaemic control compared with advice to follow a low-fat diet producing a similar weight loss. GuldbRAND et al. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00125-012-2567-4>

[24] A Randomized Pilot Trial of a Moderate Carbohydrate Diet Compared to a Very Low Carbohydrate Diet in Overweight or Obese Individuals with Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus or Prediabetes. Saslow et al. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0091027>

[25] Effects of Low-Carbohydrate and Low-Fat Diets: A Randomized Trial. Bazzano et al.

<https://doi.org/10.7326/M14-0180>

[26] The Role of Energy Expenditure in the Differential Weight Loss in Obese Women on Low-Fat and Low- Carbohydrate Diets. Brehm et al. <https://doi.org/10.1210/jc.2004-1540>

[27] Effects of a Low Carbohydrate Weight Loss Diet on Exercise Capacity and Tolerance in Obese Subjects. Brinkworth et al. <https://doi.org/10.1038/oby.2009.134>

[28] Comparative Study of the Effects of a 1-Year Dietary Intervention of a Low-Carbohydrate Diet Versus a Low-Fat Diet on Weight and Glycemic Control in Type 2 Diabetes. Davis et al. <https://doi.org/10.2337/dc08-2108>

[29] Weight and Metabolic Outcomes After 2 Years on a Low-Carbohydrate Versus Low-Fat Diet: A Randomized Trial. Foster et al. <https://doi.org/10.7326/0003-4819-153-3-201008030-00005>

[30] Effects of a Low-intensity Intervention That Prescribed a Low-carbohydrate vs. a Low-fat Diet in Obese, Diabetic Participants. Iqbal et al. <https://doi.org/10.1038/oby.2009.460>

[31] Consuming a hypocaloric high fat low carbohydrate diet for 12 weeks lowers C-reactive protein, and raises serum adiponectin and high density lipoprotein-cholesterol in obese subjects. Ruth et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.metabol.2013.07.006>

[32] Comparison of isocaloric very low carbohydrate/high saturated fat and high carbohydrate/low saturated fat diets on body composition and cardiovascular risk. Noakes et al. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1743-7075-3-7>

[33] Long-term Effects of a Very Low-Carbohydrate Diet and a Low-Fat Diet on Mood and Cognitive Function. Brinkworth et al. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archinternmed.2009.329>

[34] The effects of low-carbohydrate versus conventional weight loss diets in severely obese adults: one-year follow-up of a randomized trial. Stern et al. <https://doi.org/10.7326/0003-4819-140-10-200405180-00007>

[35] A Randomized Trial of a Low-Carbohydrate Diet vs Orlistat Plus a Low-Fat Diet for Weight Loss. Yancy et al. 2010. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archinternmed.2009.492>

[36] A randomized controlled trial of low carbohydrate and low fat/high fiber diets for weight loss. Baron et al.

<https://doi.org/10.2105/ajph.76.11.1293>

- [37] A very low-carbohydrate, low-saturated fat diet for type 2 diabetes management: a randomized trial. Tay et al. <https://doi.org/10.2337/dc14-0845>
- [38] Randomised controlled trial of four commercial weight loss programmes in the UK: initial findings from the BBC "diet trials". Truby et al. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.38833.411204.80>
- [39] Comparison of the Atkins, Ornish, Weight Watchers, and Zone Diets for Weight Loss and Heart Disease Risk Reduction: A Randomized Trial. Dansinger et al. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.293.1.43>
- [40] Very Low-Carbohydrate and Low-Fat Diets Affect Fasting Lipids and Postprandial Lipemia Differently in Overweight Men. Sharman et al. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jn/134.4.880>
- [41] Comparison of high-fat and high-protein diets with a high-carbohydrate diet in insulin-resistant obese women. McAuley et al. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00125-004-1603-4>
- [42] Diet-Induced Weight Loss Is Associated with Decreases in Plasma Serum Amyloid A and C-Reactive Protein Independent of Dietary Macronutrient Composition in Obese Subjects. O'Brien et al. <https://doi.org/10.1210/jc.2004-1011>
- [43] Advice to follow a low-carbohydrate diet has a favourable impact on low-grade inflammation in type 2 diabetes compared with advice to follow a low-fat diet. Jonasson et al. <https://doi.org/10.3109/07853890.2014.894286>
- [44] A non-calorie-restricted low-carbohydrate diet is effective as an alternative therapy for patients with type 2 diabetes. Yamada et al. <https://doi.org/10.2169/internalmedicine.53.0861>
- [45] Low-Fat Versus Low-Carbohydrate Weight Reduction Diets Effects on Weight Loss, Insulin Resistance, and Cardiovascular Risk: A Randomized Control Trial. Bradley et al. <https://doi.org/10.2337/db09-0098>
- [46] Weight loss with high and low carbohydrate 1200 kcal diets in free living women. Lean et al. <https://doi.org/10.1038/sj.ejcn.1600391>
- [47] Evaluation of weight loss and adipocytokines levels after two hypocaloric diets with different macronutrient distribution in obese subjects with rs9939609 gene variant. De Luis et al. <https://doi.org/10.1002/dmrr.2323>
- [48] Enhanced weight loss with protein-enriched meal replacements in subjects with the metabolic syndrome. Flechtner-Mors et al. <https://doi.org/10.1002/dmrr.1097>
- [49] Long-term effects of a low carbohydrate, low fat or high unsaturated fat diet compared to a no-intervention control. Lim et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.numecd.2009.05.003>
- [50] A randomized study comparing the effects of a low-carbohydrate diet and a conventional diet on lipoprotein subfractions and C-reactive protein levels in patients with severe obesity. Seshadri et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amjmed.2004.04.009>
- [51] Comparison of low- and high-carbohydrate diets for type 2 diabetes management: a randomized trial. Tay et al. <https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.115.112581>
- [52] Weight loss on low-fat vs. low-carbohydrate diets by insulin resistance status among overweight adults and adults with obesity: A randomized pilot trial. Gardner et al. <https://doi.org/10.1002/oby.21331>
- [53] Metabolic impact of a ketogenic diet compared to a hypocaloric diet in obese children and adolescents. Partsalaki et al. <https://doi.org/10.1515/jpem-2012-0131>

- [54] A randomized controlled trial of 130 g/day low-carbohydrate diet in type 2 diabetes with poor glycemic control. Sato et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clnu.2016.07.003>
- [55] Short-term safety, tolerability and efficacy of a very low-calorie-ketogenic diet interventional weight loss program versus hypocaloric diet in patients with type 2 diabetes mellitus. Goday et al. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nutd.2016.36>
- [56] Visceral adiposity and metabolic syndrome after very high-fat and low-fat isocaloric diets: a randomized controlled trial. Veum et al. <https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.115.123463>
- [57] An Online Intervention Comparing a Very Low-Carbohydrate Ketogenic Diet and Lifestyle Recommendations Versus a Plate Method Diet in Overweight Individuals With Type 2 Diabetes: A Randomized Controlled Trial. Saslow et al. <https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.5806>
- [58] Dynamics of intrapericardial and extrapericardial fat tissues during long-term, dietary-induced, moderate weight loss. Tsaban et al. <https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.117.157115>
- [59] Induced and controlled dietary ketosis as a regulator of obesity and metabolic syndrome pathologies. Gibas et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsx.2017.03.022>
- [60] Twelve-month outcomes of a randomized trial of a moderate-carbohydrate versus very low-carbohydrate diet in overweight adults with type 2 diabetes mellitus or prediabetes. Saslow et al. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41387-017-0006-9>
- [61] Effects of an energy-restricted low-carbohydrate, high unsaturated fat/low saturated fat diet versus a high-carbohydrate, low-fat diet in type 2 diabetes: A 2-year randomized clinical trial. Tay et al. <https://doi.org/10.1111/dom.13164>
- [62] Effect of Low-Fat vs Low-Carbohydrate Diet on 12-Month Weight Loss in Overweight Adults and the Association With Genotype Pattern or Insulin Secretion: The DIETFITS Randomized Clinical Trial. Gardner et al. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2018.0245>
- [63] A food based, low energy, low carbohydrate diet for people with type 2 diabetes in primary care: A randomized controlled feasibility trial. Morris et al. <https://doi.org/10.1111/dom.13915>
- [64] The Effects of a Low Calorie Ketogenic Diet on Glycaemic Control Variables in Hyperinsulinemic Overweight/Obese Females. Michalczyk et al. <https://dx.doi.org/10.3390%2Fnu12061854>
- [65] Effect of a 90 g/day low-carbohydrate diet on glycaemic control, small, dense low-density lipoprotein and carotid intima-media thickness in type 2 diabetic patients: An 18-month randomised controlled trial. Chen et al. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0240158>
- [66] Effects of weight loss during a very low carbohydrate diet on specific adipose tissue depots and insulin sensitivity in older adults with obesity: a randomized clinical trial. Goss et al. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12986-020-00481-9>
- [67] Carbohydrate Content of Diet Determines Success in Type 2 Diabetes Outcomes. Govers et al. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.metabol.2020.154591>